Geochemical Modeling to Assess Impacts of Chat Fine Injections on Aquifer Quality at the Tar Creek Superfund Site, Oklahoma

Brian Schroth, B.T. Thomas, Scott Irving CH2M HILL



Study Region





Legacy of Tri-State Lead-Zinc Mining





Study Objectives

- Reduce dust hazard by removing chat piles
- Separate coarse chat (usable for road base) from fine chat
- Inject fine chat slurry into mine rooms below piles
- Conduct long-term pilot study to assess feasibility and monitor water quality
- Sooner Pile chosen as test area
- Use geochemical modeling to
 - Verify observed results
 - Predict long term effects on water quality



From Top of Sooner Pile



Sooner Injection Pilot Study

CSM for Sooner Pile Chat Washing & Fines Injection



ote: Unless otherwise noted, the analytical results are reported in U = Non-detect

* = Results reported in mg/L



Chat Size Fraction Separator ("Sandscrew")



Chat Size Fraction Separator ("Sandscrew")





Injection of Fines Slurry



Geochemistry and Transport Modeling

Geochemical Signatures

Boone Aquifer

- Mineralized zones: Ca-SO₄, high TDS, trace metals
- Non-mineralized: variable chem, low TDS, low trace metals

Mine Pool Water

- Ca-SO4, Higher TDS than Boone, trace metals
- Rubidoux
 - Ca/Mg-HCO₃/SO₄, low TDS, very low trace metals

TDS vs. pH



TDS vs. Bicarbonate Pct.



Zinc vs. Bicarbonate Pct.



Arsenic vs. Bicarbonate Pct.



Chat and Chat Fines Composition – XRD Analysis

- Bulk chat primarily comprised of chert (amorphous SiO₂) – over 90%
- Minor carbonates (calcite, dolomite)
- Trace sulfide, oxide, clay minerals
- Fine fractions shown to have higher concentrations of metals

Chat and Chat Fines Modeled Trace Metal Minerals

• Primary Minerals

- Sphalerite (ZnS); Cd associated
- Galena (PbS)
- Pyrite (FeS₂); As associated
- Secondary Minerals
 - Carbonates of Zn, Cd, Pb, and Fe
 - Sulfates of Pb, Fe
 - Minor silcates (hemimorphite = Zn source)
 - Oxides of Cd, Fe (plus adsorbed metals on FeO's)

Reactions During Injection

- Chat fines mixed with mine pool water
 - Dissolves minerals in fines, releasing trace metals
 - Carbonates buffer acidity released by sulfide oxidation
 - Mixing at surface ensures oxygen presence in solution
 - Process modeled with PHREEQC

Reactions During Injection (cont'd)

- Chat fines slurry injected into mine pool
 - Oxygen-rich water mixes locally with more reduced mine pool water and iron oxides precipitate
 - Iron oxides act as co-precipitates with and adsorbents for trace metals (especially arsenic and lead)
 - Process modeled with PHREEQC

PHREEQC Model

- Observed minerals in chat are added to Sooner Pilot Study supply water (MMB2)
 - Zinc, lead, and cadmium sulfides
 - Calcite and dolomite
 - Resulting water reasonably resembles slurry water injected into mine pool
- Slurry water is mixed with mine pool water in various proportions with mineral precipitation and dissolution controls
 - Solubility controlled by sulfate and carbonate minerals
 - Result resembles injection well samples if ratio of mine pool water to slurry water is 2:1



PHREEQC Model Results

Dissolution of cadmium, lead, and zinc sulfides and calcium/magnesium carbonate; Precipitation of calcium, zinc, and cadmium carbonates and of iron oxide

			Metals in ug/L			
Description	Sample ID	Date	Fe	Zn	Cd	Pb
Mine pool water used to slurry fine chat	MMB2	07/17/08	391	25,900	391	276
Water portion of fine chat slurry in sandscrew tank	SNDSCR	07/17/08	<25	20,300	411	294
	PHREEQC simulation results		<25	20,967	339	318

Mix pre-injection mine pool water with SNDSCR water in the ratio 2:1; Dissolution of gypsum; Precipitation of iron oxide

			Metals in ug/L			
Description	Sample ID	Date	Fe	Zn	Cd	Pb
Pre-injection mine pool water at						
Sooner Pile	SMB2	07/11/07	11,900	11,800	8.3	3.3
Water portion of fine chat slurry						
in sandscrew tank	SNDSCR	07/17/08	<25	20,300	411	294
First post-injection mine pool						
sample at Sooner Pile	SMB2	10/24/07	<25	20,100	246	78.1
	PHREEQC simulation results		<25	14,666	143	100



Short-Term Pilot Studies: Lead





Short-Term Pilot Studies: Cadmium





Short-Term Pilot Studies: Zinc





PHAST Model

- Groundwater flow and solute transport model combined with PHREEQC
- Transport simulated with parameters from site groundwater flow model (conductivity, gradients) and modified with transport parameters
 - Dispersion
 - Cation exchange
 - Adsorption
 - Mineral precipitation



PHAST Simulations

- Pre-injection mine water introduced as continuous flow into Boone Aquifer (outside of mine influence): 40 years
- Sooner injection well data were diluted based on results from dilution simulation within mine workings: 5-year injection
- Diluted water flows into Boone: 20 years
- One-dimensional flow was simulated for simplicity



PHAST Simulations

- Post-injection water represented by October 2009 sample from well SMB3 – washed fines injection well from Sooner Pile
- General mine pool water represented by pre-injection sample from well SMB2 – also from Sooner Pile
- These two waters were mixed in different proportions using PHREEQC to represent different stages of discharge into Boone
- Boone aquifer represented by well BW13 outside of mine influence



PHAST Model Layout: Phase 1

Pre-Injection Mine Water (Ca-SO4, pH 6.3)



2,000 Feet



PHAST Model Layout: Phase 2

Diluted Post-Injection Water (Ca-SO4, pH 6.3-6.6)

Boone Aquifer Affected by Historical Mine Discharge (Ca-HCO3-SO4, pH 7)



Exchange Reactions on Carbonate and Clay Mineral Surfaces

Precipitation of Metal Carbonate Minerals

2,000 Feet

PHAST Model Results Phase 1: 10 years (~1980)



PHAST Model Results Phase 1: 20 years (~1990)



PHAST Model Results Phase 1: 40 years (~2010)



PHAST Model Results Phase 2 Sooner: 5 years



PHAST Model Results Phase 2 Sooner: 25 years



Conclusions: Geochemistry

- Trace metal minerals and salts dissolve during slurry process
- Injected slurry temporarily increases metals concentrations in mine pool
- Concentrations return to original levels after injection stops (trapped in fines)
- Injection expected to have little effect on discharge to Boone Aquifer
 - Higher concentrations temporary
 - High dilution in mine workings
 - Further attenuation after discharge

Questions?



Groundwater Flow Directions





Piper Diagram





Boone Groundwater Chemistry





Mine Pool Water Chemistry





Rubidoux Groundwater Chemistry





PHAST Model

- Alternative to use of K_d for adsorption by explicitly modeling adsorption of metals to mineral surfaces
- Database contains expressions for adsorption to hydrous ferric oxides, the most common adsorbent
- Can add published expressions for other minerals (carbonates used in this study)
- Measured or assumed mineral concentrations provide more realistic ceiling for adsorption reactions
 - K_d assumes unlimited adsorption capacity



Dilution from Sooner Location





Dilution from Sooner Location





Observed Data: Douthat



IHOLLISTER/PROJITAR_CREEKITCOU4FSPADDENDUM_380567/MAPFILES/OU4_BOONE_ANALYTICAL_DATA_MINEWORKINGS.MXD_CRIVERS 9/30/2009 12:54:48



Observed Data: Douthat

