

## BUNKER HILL SUPERFUND SITE: ECOLOGICAL RESTORATION PROGRAM

by

Sally Brown<sup>1</sup>, Chuck Henry<sup>2</sup>, Rufus Chaney<sup>1</sup>, and Harry Compton<sup>3</sup>  
<sup>1</sup>USDA-ARS, <sup>2</sup>University of Washington, and <sup>3</sup>US EPA

**Abstract.** Bunker Hill ID was the site of mining and smelting activities for many decades. As a result of these activities, soils on the hillsides adjacent to the site became contaminated with Pb, Zn, and Cd. In addition to metal contamination, pH of the soils became highly acidic. Native vegetation has died off and the soils have become highly erosive. An application of municipal biosolids in combination with wood ash and log yard wood waste was made to test the potential of this remediation mixture to reduce erosion, correct soil pH, and support a self sustaining vegetative cover. Biosolids improve soil physical properties and provide macro and micro nutrients. Wood ash serves as a lime substitute and a source of nutrients. Log yard waste improves physical properties and has a high C:N ratio that reduces the potential for N leaching. Initial results are promising. A healthy stand of grasses and legumes has been established. In addition, the application mixture has proven itself to be highly resistant to erosion.

### Introduction

The Bunker Hill Superfund site in the Coeur d'Alene River Basin is the second largest Superfund site in the nation. This area had been the nation's largest and richest mining district, with mining and smelting of Zn and Pb during the period 1916 until the early 1980's. Smelting of Zn and Pb sulfide ores resulted in aerial deposition of high concentrations of Pb, Zn, Cd, and As as well as sulfur compounds. The subsequent decrease in soil pH, coupled with the elevated concentrations of metals resulted in phytotoxicity to existing vegetation. Without a vegetative cover, mountain soils became highly susceptible to erosion and a substantial portion of the surface layer has washed into the Coeur d'Alene River Basin. In areas of high erosion, soil samples from the affected mountainsides now contain total Zn < 800 mg/kg and total Pb < 300 mg/kg, in contrast to earlier surface soil concentrations of up to 29,000 mg/kg Zn (Ragaini et al. 1977). In other areas, not so highly

eroded, soil samples remain with total Zn over 4000 mg/kg and total Pb over 2500 mg/kg, while mine tailings and chat have measured concentrations of over 24,000 mg/kg Zn and 5000 mg/kg Pb.

Even prior to being designated as a Superfund site, several attempts to restore the effected areas had been undertaken. The construction of terraces (Hansen and Mitchell 1978) as well as the addition of agronomic rates of limestone and fertilizers were not sufficient to establish a vegetative cover in a number of efforts. Grass survival is generally limited to 2 growing seasons following hydroseeding. In addition to metals, erosion removed many of the macro and micro nutrients necessary for plant growth. Soil physical properties were also impacted. Without a surface organic horizon, the soil water holding capacity has been reduced.

Similar sites in Palmerton, PA and Katowice, Poland (with soil Zn concentrations in excess of 20,000 mg/kg) have been successfully revegetated with the addition of high rates of biosolids in combination with fly ash (used as a liming agent and to improve the handling properties of the mixture) and lime or limestone. The Palmerton site is characterized by severe slopes that made any type of tillage unrealistic, and such extreme erosion that little soil materials remained on the slopes. Surface application of the flyash/biosolids mixture adhered well on the sloping soils, while allowing for water penetration and seedling emergence (Horsehead Resource Development 1993). In a follow-up study on a Borough Park/Garden lot within Palmerton Borough,

---

<sup>1</sup>Sally L. Brown, Ph. D., and Rufus L. Chaney, Ph.D., Environmental Chemistry Laboratory, Agricultural Research Service, USDA, Beltsville, Maryland 20705

<sup>2</sup>Charles L. Henry, PE, Ph.D. University of Washington, College of Forest Resources, Box 352100, Seattle, WA 98195-2100

<sup>3</sup>Harry Compton, US EPA ERT, Edison, New Jersey 08837

high Fe, high lime biosolids compost (Compro) was compared with fertilizer and fertilizer plus limestone as incorporated soil amendments to establish lawn grasses on the sparsely vegetated highly phytotoxic soil (over 40,000  $\mu\text{g/g}$  Zn, 2000  $\mu\text{g/g}$  Cd, and pH 6.2-6.5). One unexpected outcome was the delayed reaction of agricultural limestone, apparently because the high soil Zn adsorbed on the carbonate and slowed dissolution. Although the lime requirement plus 20 T limestone/A were applied, after three years the limestone treated plots were still not neutral pH. Incorporation of the limed high-Fe biosolids compost immediately raised soil pH to 7.5.

In the technology transfer demonstration plots in Katowice, Poland, Zn/Pb smelter slag had remained barren for about 50 years; it contained over 2% Zn and 2% Pb, and was somewhat acidic. A mixture of waste slaked lime, limestone, and biosolids were mixed with several inches of slag (Stuczynski et al. 1997). The following proposal uses the information gained at both of these sites in an attempt to limit the spread of contaminants through the restoration of a native, forested ecosystem.

The Bunker Hill Superfund site is a highly visible site; success in restoration is both environmentally and politically of paramount importance. Application of tailor-made remediation mixtures (such as biosolids and wood ash) to the surface of these soils addresses the problems at this site. Amorphous oxide minerals that are precipitated during wastewater treatment process are able to tightly bind trace metals and thereby limit metal phytoavailability, leachability and bioavailability. Wood ash has a high calcium carbonate equivalent that can raise soil pH and make the soil calcareous. Research has shown that application of a liming material in combination with an biodegradable organic matter-rich product such as biosolids results in the formation of soluble Ca compounds that correct soil pH in subsurface soils (Brown et al. 1997). Biosolids in combination with wood ash provides high levels of N, P, and K, balanced levels of Ca and Mg, in addition to the plant-required micronutrients. Biosolids also provide organic matter that both improves soil tilth and provides a substrate for soil microbes; and the organic matter holds nitrogen which can be mineralized over time to support development of a balanced vegetated system. Surface application of the biosolids/ash mixture creates a new soil horizon that is capable of supporting plant growth.

USDA was asked to assist Region 10 EPA in demonstrating the effectiveness of this approach. A team of scientists and residuals managers (USDA, U. of

Washington, U. of Idaho, the Northwest Biosolids Management Association, and Washington Water Power) installed spring and fall demonstration and research plots in 1997 using the tailor-made remediation treatments. Biosolids from King County, Everett, Tacoma and Cowlitz County, WA, and Post Falls, Hayden, and Coeur d'Alene, ID were mixed with wood ash from Washington Water Power, Louisiana Pacific or Kimberly-Clark. This paper discusses preliminary results from the spring installations.

#### Research and Demonstration Objectives

The overall goal of the research and demonstration efforts at Bunker Hill is to investigate methods for establishment of stable, long-term vegetated and healthy ecosystems. Due to the success of many disturbed soil reclamation efforts throughout the country using organic residuals, we strongly believed that a combination of biosolids, wood ash and other organic amendments could be an effective tool in long-term revegetation and restoration at Bunker Hill. However, in light of past failed attempts using conventional methods to restore these denuded lands, we recognized the value of a carefully planned investigation to determine the best method for use in these unique environmental conditions. Thus, we approach this project in phases, ultimately developing a prescription with the highest possible chances of success; an approach which could be applied at disturbed metal contaminated sites anywhere.

We have the following objectives:

- To develop soil amendment methods to reduce erosion.
- To determine long-term plant establishment techniques.
- To achieve reduction of metal phytoavailability and bioavailability.
- To develop application technique efficacy.
- To develop techniques that enhance nutrient and organic matter conservation and cycling.
- To document ecosystem restoration and remediation of toxic effects of contaminated soils by use of a combination of organic residuals and by-products such as ash or flyash.

#### Phase 1: Installation of Demonstration Plots

Dewatered biosolids from King County and Everett, WA were tested along with material from Post Falls, Hayden, and Coeur d'Alene, ID. Based on the criteria set out in EPA 503, all biosolids used in this study qualify as Class B biosolids. Each source of

biosolids was mixed with a 1:1 blend of wood ash from Washington Water Power and Louisiana Pacific. Biosolids from King County and Everett were applied at 55 and 110 dry Mg/ha. Biosolids from the Idaho WWTP's were mixed and applied at a rate of 110 dry Mg/ha. Ash was applied at a constant rate of 220 wet Mg/ha to provide 50 Mg/ha calcium carbonate equivalent. In addition, logyard wood waste from Crown Pacific was added at a fixed volume ratio of 1:5. Materials and soils characteristics are presented in Table 1. Treatments were mixed on a volume basis using a front end loader. This type of mixing technique was also

used at a similar site in Palmerton, PA. It is possible to determine the accuracy of the mixing by analysis of samples taken from each plot (Table 2).

A seeding mixture of grasses and legumes was added to the biosolids/ash amendment mixture immediately prior to surface application at a rate of 30 kg/ha. The mixture used met the specifications outlined by EPA Region 10 in their attempt to restore native vegetation to the site. Seeds were hand scattered over each treatment mix before loading into the application vehicle.

Table 1. Characteristics of the materials used in the field trial of biosolids, wood ash, and logyard waste at the Bunker Hill, ID CERCLA site.

	Zn	Cd	Pb	pH	Carbon	Nitrogen
	----- mg/kg -----				----- % -----	
<b>Biosolids</b>						
King County	915	3.5	141	8.1	29	4.4
Everett	1652	21.5	380	6.5	26	2.8
Post Falls	326	1.8	29	7.8	34	5.7
Coeur d'Alene	612	2.1	54	8.1	32	4.9
<b>Wood Ash</b>						
Washington Water Power	534	4.9	69	12.8	23	0.1
Louisiana Pacific	284	1.9	40	8.4	13	0.1
<b>Logyard Waste</b>						
Crown Pacific	85.5	0.5	15	7.2	8.8	0.2

Table 2. Characteristics of the treatments (biosolids applied at 2 rates, mixed with wood ash and wood waste applied at a constant rate) used in the replicated field trial ( $\pm$ SD).

	Zn	Cd	Pb	pH	Carbon	Nitrogen	Solids	Depth
	----- mg/kg -----				----- % -----			(cm)
<b>Everett</b>								
25 Mg ha	1809 $\pm$ 409	6.1 $\pm$ 0.7	265 $\pm$ 95	8.4 $\pm$ 0.4	17 $\pm$ 2	0.5 $\pm$ 0.1	60 $\pm$ 5	4.1 $\pm$ 2.5
50 Mg ha	1143 $\pm$ 182	9.0 $\pm$ 0.6	217 $\pm$ 17	7.6 $\pm$ 0.1	20 $\pm$ 2	1.1 $\pm$ 0.2	49 $\pm$ 7	6.1 $\pm$ 2.3
<b>King County</b>								
25 Mg ha	1213 $\pm$ 438	2.7 $\pm$ 0.1	102 $\pm$ 15	8.7 $\pm$ 0.2	19 $\pm$ 3	1.0 $\pm$ 0.2	45 $\pm$ 3	4.6 $\pm$ 1.8
50 Mg ha	873 $\pm$ 103	2.7 $\pm$ 0.1	228 $\pm$ 34	8.5 $\pm$ 0.1	21 $\pm$ 4	1.8 $\pm$ 0.6	37 $\pm$ 3	8.1 $\pm$ 2.3
<b>Idaho</b>								
50 Mg ha	554 $\pm$ 20	2.6 $\pm$ 0.1	168 $\pm$ 30	8.4 $\pm$ 0.1	24 $\pm$ 1	2.2 $\pm$ 0.3	30 $\pm$ 4	5.8 $\pm$ 1.8

The experiment was set up on a tailings site directly off I-90 using a Completely Randomized Design with 3 replications. The site was on a slope with limited vegetation on the top of the slope directly adjacent to the roadway. The majority of the plot area was devoid of vegetation. The surface of the soil was covered by large rocks. Four soil samples on a grid were taken from each plot and analyzed separately. Results of the analysis (Table 2) suggest that the soils on the I-90 plots are a mixture of mine tailings and overburden that had been moved to this location from elsewhere on the property.

All treatments were applied using an Aerospread on a Rottne chassis. This application vehicle is ideally suited to the surface application of the semi-solid biosolids/ash mixture. The machine has sufficient traction to access the existing terraces and can accurately distribute the mixture for up to 65 m in either direction from the roadway. Another problem at Bunker Hill is that the slopes often exceed 50%. The combination of fly ash and biosolids formed a product with very high adhesive properties. This enabled the mixture to remain on the hillsides while simultaneously permitting seedling emergence and increasing water permeability. During installation of the plots, a severe storm accompanied by a tornado watch did not cause any erosion of the applied amendments, including those on very steep slopes. From our observations, it appeared that pedestrian traffic was unaware of our operations other than immediately during applications, indicating that odor was not a problem.

In addition to this experiment, a single plot was installed in the area immediately adjacent to the Bitterroot revegetation trial on the hillsides directly above the site of the Zn smelter. This plot will provide a direct comparison of the remediation technologies. Soil and plant samples were taken from the vicinity of the plot area (Tables 3 and 4). Metal concentrations in these soils were high enough to inhibit plant growth. The Zn concentrations in the white pine needles and grass are above phytotoxic levels, while Mg and Ca are both below deficiency levels. The high C concentrations of these soil samples, coupled with the high metal concentrations, suggest that level of microbial activity at this site has been reduced due to metal toxicity. An active microbial population would have used the soil C as an energy source and thereby reduced the total C concentrations in the soil.

#### Interim Results

Germination and growth of grasses was noted on a site visit, 12 days after establishment of test plots. A second visit, 30 days after treatment application

showed extensive germination on the Everett biosolids amended treatments with some germination visible on all other treatments. The second visit did not include an inspection of the plot on the hillside. A third visit, on July 14th noted continued growth on the Everett Plots, and germination on the hillside plot. In addition, excess biosolids/ash mix that had been sprayed onto a previously hydroseeded slope has caused lush growth on that slope.

The most recent visit on August 1 showed almost complete coverage on the Everett plots, including both grasses and legumes. The Hillside site also showed significant, though less complete, establishment of grasses. Other plots have relatively little plant establishment. It is likely that these observed differences in treatments are results of either the effect of temporary ammonia toxicity, or the different stabilities of the biosolids tested. Both the King County and Idaho biosolids have high ammonium concentrations, and, following mixture with ash, will have high rates of ammonia evolving. Also, these biosolids presumably experience a rapid degradation of organic material immediately after application. This generates acetic acid that can inhibit seed germination. This is a short term effect does not have any long-term implications on the potential usefulness of these biosolids. Due to the lower N content and more stable organic matter, both of these effects were presumably minor in the Everett treatments, allowing for germination and good plant growth.

Plant samples collected during the August site visit were analyzed for macro and micro nutrients; results shown in Table 5. There has been a significant reduction of Zn concentration in the grass of all the treated plots compared to the control, but the most dramatic effect was the increased concentration of P and K in all grass in the treated plots compared to control.

The plots were reseeded in mid September. Observations in mid October of emerging plants suggest that full germination will be achieved by spring 1998. The adhesive properties of the biosolids/ash mixture suggest that delayed germination will not have any adverse affect on the long-term effectiveness of the soil amendments for reducing erosion.

Preliminary microbial assessments indicate the contaminated soils at Bunker Hill are almost devoid of microbial activity. However, two months after our treatments were installed, both the treatments and the soil six inches below the treatments show good and highly diverse microbial populations.

Table 3. Characteristics of the soils in the field trial at the Bunker Hill, ID CERCLA site ( $\pm$ SD).

	Zn	Cd	Pb	pH	Carbon	Nitrogen
	----- mg/kg -----		% -----			
<b>I-90 plots</b>						
Plot 1	6000 $\pm$ 6700	12 $\pm$ 2	3200 $\pm$ 2400	6.5 $\pm$ 0.6	0.83 $\pm$ .74	0.033 $\pm$ .025
Plot 2	12000 $\pm$ 2600	21 $\pm$ 10	2100 $\pm$ 900	6.9 $\pm$ 0.5	0.52 $\pm$ .26	0.018 $\pm$ .005
Plot 3	10800 $\pm$ 6300	17 $\pm$ 6	3200 $\pm$ 2400	7.0 $\pm$ 0.3	0.41 $\pm$ .27	0.020 $\pm$ .008
Plot 4	14700 $\pm$ 6300	21 $\pm$ 4	4900 $\pm$ 2200	6.3 $\pm$ 1.0	0.48 $\pm$ .13	0.018 $\pm$ .010
Plot 5	11100 $\pm$ 7200	9 $\pm$ 3	2100 $\pm$ 1500	6.4 $\pm$ 0.4	0.40 $\pm$ .18	0.020 $\pm$ .014
Plot 6	11700 $\pm$ 7100	11 $\pm$ 3	2400 $\pm$ 1500	6.7 $\pm$ 0.4	0.44 $\pm$ .21	0.018 $\pm$ .015
Plot 7	5500 $\pm$ 6300	7 $\pm$ 3	4500 $\pm$ 3600	4.6 $\pm$ 1.7	0.16 $\pm$ .10	0.020 $\pm$ .000
Plot 8	9400 $\pm$ 7100	28 $\pm$ 18	3400 $\pm$ 3000	6.1 $\pm$ 1.1	0.35 $\pm$ .18	0.020 $\pm$ .008
Plot 9	10200 $\pm$ 6400	18 $\pm$ 14	3600 $\pm$ 2200	6.0 $\pm$ 0.4	0.46 $\pm$ .10	0.028 $\pm$ .010
Plot 10	7900 $\pm$ 7000	16 $\pm$ 5	1500 $\pm$ 1100	6.7 $\pm$ 0.4	0.35 $\pm$ .10	0.018 $\pm$ .010
Plot 11	7800 $\pm$ 5900	19 $\pm$ 11	2133 $\pm$ 1400	6.6 $\pm$ 0.2	0.39 $\pm$ .28	0.018 $\pm$ .010
Plot 12	9000 $\pm$ 4800	22 $\pm$ 11	2600 $\pm$ 2000	6.9 $\pm$ 0.3	0.42 $\pm$ .06	0.020 $\pm$ .008
<b>Hillside plots</b>						
0-15 cm	1300 $\pm$ 1000	21 $\pm$ 13	700 $\pm$ 600	4.4 $\pm$ 0.1	3.7 $\pm$ 2.3	0.14 $\pm$ .06
0-2.5 cm	3000 $\pm$ 1500	44 $\pm$ 19	2000 $\pm$ 800	4.4 $\pm$ 0.2	12.0 $\pm$ 10.8	0.31 $\pm$ .16
2.5-15 cm	1000 $\pm$ 600	21 $\pm$ 10	700 $\pm$ 700	4.3 $\pm$ 0.1	4.2 $\pm$ 3.1	0.17 $\pm$ .02

Table 4. Elemental concentrations in plants collected from Hillside site at the Bunker Hill, ID CERCLA site (June 1, 1997, prior to treatment).

	Zn	Cd	Cu	P	K	Ca	Fe	Mg	Mn
	----- (mg/kg) -----								
Grass	310	1.5	14	1700	23000	920	154	430	170
Elderberry leaf	38	0.4	15	3200	23000	5900	68	1700	37
White pine needle	370	3.9	6	1100	3700	1400	290	630	490

We will continue to monitor these plots for vegetation establishment and growth, plant uptake of metals, changes in soil chemistry, the status of the N and C added in the treatments, and effect on microbial activity. In Spring 1998 we will plant white pine seedlings and follow their survival and growth characteristics.

#### Phase II Installation

A second phase of this research was installed October this year, as a series of smaller plots with

specific research objectives. These were designed to investigate the best prescription and the effect of different organic amendment sources for large-scale restoration efforts at Bunker Hill. The primary objectives for this phase are:

- To determine the effectiveness of different locally available residuals
- To compare ratios of different amendments
- To determine the most effective seeding time
- To predict long-term fate of restoration efforts

Table 5. Elemental concentrations in plants collected from Phase I I-90 plots (August 1, 1997).

	Zn	Cd	Cu	P	K
	----- mg/kg -----			--- g/kg ---	
Control	215	0.4	3.9	590	10
Everett					
Low	102	1.4	11.6	3620	47
High	150	2.3	11.4	3800	38
King County					
Low	118	1.2	16.1	3600	34
High	108	0.6	9.9	6830	26
Idaho					
High	59	0.9	13.8	6110	25

Four different biosolids were used for this phase, in addition to three different wood ashes, two composts, one pulp and paper sludges, and logyard waste. We are interested in the least amount of materials that will give us long-term restoration and good throwing characteristics. Also, from what we learned from Phase I, we are investigating the length of time required before seeding.

Measurements during this phase will be more intensive than during Phase I, including vegetation evaluations, the fate of metals, carbon and nitrogen, soil microbial assessments, and soil/treatment erosion.

#### Preliminary Conclusions

Preliminary results indicate that application of a mixture of biosolids and ash is highly successful in revegetation and erosion control for long-term restoration. A vigorous combination of grasses and legumes on the plots indicate a self-sustaining vegetative cover.

The mixture appears to be highly adhesive. There has been no movement of material from the plots by several erosive weather events.

On plots applied with biosolids containing high N, seeding immediately after application resulted in poor germination due to ammonia toxicity, but reseeding efforts have shown this effect is very temporary. It would appear that it is possible to seed immediately after application when a low N (<1.5%) biosolids is used.

#### Acknowledgments

The authors would like to acknowledge the following organizations Northwest Biosolids Management Association, Ram Enterprises, Washington Water Power, and US EPA Region 10.

#### Literature Cited

- Brown, S.L., R.L. Chaney, C.A. Lloyd and J.S. Angle. 1997. Subsurface liming and metal movement in soils amended with lime-stabilized biosolids. *J. Environ. Qual.* 26:724-732.  
<https://doi.org/10.2134/jeq1997.00472425002600030018x>
- Hansen, J. E., and J.E. Mitchell. 1978. The role of terraces and soil amendments in revegetating steep, smelter-affected land. *Reclamation Review*. V1 pp 103-112.
- Horsehead Resource Development Co. 1993. Palmerton Zinc NPL site, Blue Mountain Operable Unit, Thirty Acre study, final report. Submitted to US EPA.
- Ragaini, R.C., H.R. Ralston and N. Roberts. 1977. Environmental trace metal contamination in Kellogg, Idaho near a lead smelting complex. *Environ. Sci. Technol.* 11:773-781.  
<https://doi.org/10.1021/es60131a004>
- Stuczynski, T., W.L. Daniels, K. Pantuck, F. Pistelok. 1997. Stabilization and revegetation of metal smelter wastes in Poland. National Meeting of the American Society for Surface Mining and Reclamation. Austin TX May 1-5, 1996.